2	SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF NEW YORK: CIVIL TERM: PART 35	
3		-X
4	UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOCIATION; UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS ASSOCIATION OF	
5	GREATER NEW YORK; CORRECTION OFFICERS' BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION OF THE CITY OF NEW	
6	YORK, INC.; POLICE BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK, INC.; SERGEANTS	
7	BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION; LIEUTENANTS BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION; CAPTAINS	
8	ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION; AND DETECTIVES' ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION,	
9	Petitioners/Plaintiffs,	_ ,
10	-against-	Index No. 154982/2020
11	BILL DE BLASIO, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY	
12	AS MAYOR OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK; THE CITY OF NEW YORK; FIRE DEPARTMENT OF THE	
13	CITY OF NEW YORK; DANIEL A. NIGRO, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS THE COMMISSIONER OF	
14	THE FIRE DEPARTMENT OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK; NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF	
15	CORRECTION; CYNTHIA BRANN, IN HER OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS THE COMMISSIONER OF	
16	THE NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTION; DERMOT F. SHEA, IN HIS	
17	OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS THE COMMISSIONER OF THE NEW YORK CITY POLICE DEPARTMENT; THE	
18	NEW YORK CITY POLICE DEPARTMENT; FREDERICK DAVIE, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY	
19	AS THE CHAIR OF THE CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD; AND THE CIVILIAN COMPLAINT	
20	REVIEW BOARD,	
21	Respondents/Defendants.	
	OFFICIAL ADDRESS: 60 Centre Street	
22	New York, New York July 15, 2020	1000/
23	B E F O R E: (Via Skype)	
	- -	the Commerce C
25	HON. CAROL EDMEAD, Justice of	
26	(Appearances on the following page	.)

2	APPEARANCES: (Via Skype)
3	
4	DLA PIPER US LLP Attorneys for the Petitioners/Plaintiffs
5	1251 Avenue of the Americas New York, New York 10020-1104
6	BY: ANTHONY P. COLES, ESQ. JOHN WRAY, ESQ.
7	
8	NEW YORK CITY LAW DEPARTMENT OFFICE OF THE CORPORATION COUNSEL
9	Attorneys for the Respondents/Defendants 100 Church Street
10	New York, New York 10007, New York ZIP BY: REBECCA JO QUINN, ESQ.
11	DOMINIQUE SAINT-FORT, ESQ.
12	ALSOPRESENT: (Via Skype)
13	GRACE ANN C. LAZARO, Law Secretary
14	MICHAEL W. CAVARRETTA, Law Secretary
15	SAMMER OSMAN, Court Clerk
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	* * * * * * * * * *
26	LAURA L. LUDOVICO Senior Court Reporter 60 Centre Street - Room 420

3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

1	Proceedings
2	THE COURT: Mr. Osman?
3	THE CLERK: Yes, Your Honor.
4	THE COURT: Okay. All right. Mr. Osman, you are
5	there?
6	THE CLERK: Yes, Your Honor.
7	THE COURT: Okay. Let's get the law sectaries
8	and then let's get appearances.
9	THE CLERK: They are all here as well, Your
10	Honor.
11	THE COURT: Can we get appearances then?
12	MR. COLES: Your Honor, my name is Tony Coles,
13	counsel for the petitioners/plaintiffs from the Law Firm of
14	DLA Piper.
15	THE COURT: Excellent.
16	Next.
17	MR. COLES: My colleague is John Wray, W-R-A-Y,
18	also from DLA Piper.
19	THE COURT: Thank you.
20	Next.
21	MS. QUINN: Good morning, Your Honor.
22	Rebecca Quinn from the New York City Law
23	Department on behalf of the Defendants/Respondents.
24	THE COURT: Thank you.
25	Next.
26	MS. SAINT-FORT: Good morning, Your Honor.
	Laura L. Ludovico, SCR

1	Proceedings	
2	Dominique Saint-Fort from the New York City Law Department,	
3	also on behalf of the respondents.	
4	THE COURT: You'll have to spell your last name,	
5	please.	
6	MS. SAINT-FORT: Sure. Saint Fort, S-A-I-N-T,	
7	dash F-O-R-T, Saint-Fort.	
8	THE COURT: Thank you. And you're for the	
9	Defendants/Respondents as well, right?	
10	MS. SAINT-FORT: Yes, Your Honor.	
11	THE COURT: Anyone else?	
12	Okay. Let's hear from counsel for	
13	Plaintiffs/Petitioners.	
14	If you are not speaking, please mute your mic so	
15	we don't get echo. Thank you, all.	
16	Now, Mr. Coles, Mr. Wray, first question is	
17	directed to you. We understand that this arises from the	
18	repeal of New York City Civil Rights Law § 50-a, I believe,	
19	subparagraph one.	
20	Why do you need this relief today?	
21	MR. COLES: Your Honor, thank you very much.	
22	That obviously is the core question for the proceeding	
23	today.	
24	The issue here is the repeal of 50-a did not also	
25	repeal well-settled New York City laws regarding collective	
26	bargaining, regarding due process, regarding contract law	
	Laura L. Ludovico, SCR	

2.4

Proceedings

and regarding Article 78. The reason we need a TRO today, it appears to be the City's position, is they simply want to ignore the independent existence of the rights of the petitioners and the plaintiffs in this case under settled law to have certain review and certain scoping done of the rule 50-a applications, who we have been told -- I've had a number of conversations with the Law Department and we had come close to having an agreement under which the release of documents would tentatively or provisionally be put on hold while this matter was briefed. We ultimately could not reach an agreement on that.

My clients, who are the five police unions, the two fire unions and the correction officers' unions, 65,000 approximately, law enforcement members, have been told that as early as this week in the wake of the repeal of 50-a, the City is on the verge of a hasty and rushed decision to publish and promote on the internet the personnel records of thousands of officers that contain -- and this is critical -- nonfinal and unsubstantiated claims and allegations. It is basically a document dump with no individualized assessment for any determination as to matters that are unproven or unfounded.

The --

MS. QUINN: I'm sorry, I have to -- I'm sorry, Mr. Coles, to interrupt.

1	Proceedings	
2	THE COURT: Who's speaking, please?	
3	MS. QUINN: I'm sorry, Your Honor. This is	
4	Rebecca Quinn for the respondents.	
5	THE COURT: Thank you. Go ahead.	
6	MS. QUINN: Thank you so much.	
7	I just have to let the Court know that this	
8	matter has now been removed based on federal question	
9	jurisdiction.	
10	THE COURT: Well, if the matter has been removed,	
11	all this Court is to see is the removal document and then	
12	there is no more for us to say. However, the application	
13	for a stay, will that be then immediately addressed by the	
14	Federal Court?	
15	MS. QUINN: Okay. Your Honor, can I forward	
16	those papers to Mr. Osman?	
17	THE COURT: You can upload it and eFile and then	
18	you could attach it to Mr. Osman.	
19	Will there be an interim stay being considered	
20	immediately by the Federal Court?	
21	MS. QUINN: Your Honor	
22	THE COURT: The question I have clearly is,	
23	simply is, if, as the plaintiffs/petitioners point out,	
24	there is the anticipatory disclosure of this information,	
25	which could be as early as today. Will the interim stay be	
26	before the Federal Court before there is any disclosure of	
	Laura L. Ludovico, SCR	

1 Proceedings 2 this information? 3 MS. QUINN: I believe as long as it's before the 4 Court today, Your Honor, yes, that would be today before 5 the Court's conversation. THE COURT: I understand, but you see what you 6 7 just said? "I believe it will be before the Court today." 8 There is a concern, of course, for the petitioners in this 9 case because that is a critical issue in their application 10 by Order to Show Cause. So if you can give an assurance 11 that there will be no disclosures related to the repeal of 12 New York City Civil Rights Law § 50-a(1) prior to the 13 matter getting before the Federal Court, we are done. MS. QUINN: Okay. Can we endeavor to obtain 14 15 those assurances, Your Honor? 16 THE COURT: Well, the question I have is unless and until that is done, it's open. You see what I'm 17 18 saying? 19 Or this Court can just fashion an order that says 20 that the Court has been made aware that -- Grace, this is 21 to you. 22 MS. LAZARO: Yes, Your Honor. 23 THE COURT: The Court has been made aware that 2.4 this matter has been remanded to the Federal Court. 25 Court's concern, of course, is that pending the matter 26 being heard before the Federal Court, that the issue of the Laura L. Ludovico, SCR

1 Proceedings 2 interim stay is critical and I'm inclined to grant an 3 interim stay pending this matter being before the Federal 4 Court. I just don't want there to be a gap. 5 I understand, Your Honor. MS. QUINN: THE COURT: Do you have a problem with the Court 6 7 fashioning that order? 8 MS. QUINN: As long -- if I'm understanding Your 9 Honor correctly, the stay would be pending the Federal 10 Court hearing the application for the TRO. 11 THE COURT: Absolutely. 12 MS. QUINN: Okay. Yes, that's -- I understand 13 that, Your Honor, and thank you, that's -- respondents 14 agree to that. 15 THE COURT: So, counsel for 16 plaintiffs/petitioners, I will fashion a short order that 17 says just what I have said and you have an interim stay 18 pending the issue of the stay being brought before the 19 Federal Court with this remand, do you understand? 20 MR. COLES: Your Honor, thank you very much and 21 thank you very much for raising that important issue. 22 And I don't know whether or not we'll see you 23 again on this case, but thank you this morning for this 2.4 If we do, I look forward to that in the future. 25 THE COURT: Let me say this finally. I will do a 26 short order that says exactly what I've said. It will be Laura L. Ludovico, SCR

1	Proceedings
2	signed immediately and I expect immediately to see the
3	transfer order so, you know, I'm working with a full
4	picture. Okay, everyone?
5	That is directed to Ms. Quinn and Ms. Saint Fort,
6	okay?
7	MS. QUINN: Yes, Your Honor. Thank you.
8	THE COURT: All right.
9	MR. COLES: Thank you, Your Honor.
10	THE COURT: I'll do that right now. Everyone,
11	good luck and stay well.
12	MR. COLES: Thank you.
13	(WHEREUPON, court is recessed and the case
14	adjourned.)
15	* * * * * *
16	(WHEREUPON, the case was recalled.)
17	THE COURT: Okay. Mr. Osman, who is here?
18	THE CLERK: Yes, Your Honor. We have Ms. Quinn,
19	we have Ms. Saint-Fort, we also have Mr. Coles, who is
20	appearing by phone.
21	THE COURT: Okay, and the reporter is on?
22	
	THE CLERK: Yes, Your Honor.
23	THE CLERK: Yes, Your Honor. THE COURT: So I've received the e-mail from, I
23	
	THE COURT: So I've received the e-mail from, I
24	THE COURT: So I've received the e-mail from, I believe it's Ms. Quinn, at least Ms. Quinn, it may also be

1	Proceedings
2	consenting to the interim stay, which had been discussed
3	when we were on the call earlier, but your position is that
4	the Court has no authority to enter a stay pending the
5	issue being before the Federal Court?
6	MS. QUINN: That's correct, Your Honor.
7	Respectfully, I was made aware of that provision and just
8	wanted to notify the Court.
9	THE COURT: That provision says that the
10	you're reading of that provision, which sentence makes it
11	clear to you that the stay would be inappropriate? Tell me
12	the sentence in that provision, please.
13	MS. QUINN: Okay. Just one second.
14	THE COURT: Yes.
15	(Brief pause in the record.)
16	MS. QUINN: The last sentence.
17	THE COURT: Says?
18	MS. QUINN: "And the State Court shall proceed no
19	further unless and until the case is remanded."
20	THE COURT: Okay. Now, Mr. Coles.
21	(Brief pause in the record.)
22	THE COURT: Is it Mr. Coles?
23	MR. COLES: Yes.
24	THE COURT: How do you
25	MR. COLES: Yes, I'm here.
26	I don't have any problem with the order. I
	Laura L. Ludovico, SCR

1 Proceedings 2 thought they consented to the order a half hour ago. 3 THE COURT: They have since withdrawn that based 4 on an e-mail that was sent to the Court a few moments ago 5 where they said that -- they attached the document of 6 removal and they indicated that, according to the section 7 from which she just read -- what are you citing from please so he's aware? 8 9 MR. COLES: I don't have the order in front of 10 me. I'm sorry, I'm on the --11 THE COURT: I understand. I'm asking Ms. Quinn, 12 what are you citing from when you say: "And the Court 13 shall...?" You're citing from -- I don't have it in front of me. 14 15 MS. QUINN: Yes, Your Honor, I'm sorry, I'll get 16 it up. And I am remiss for not cc'ing Mr. Coles on the 17 e-mail to Mr. Osman. It's 28 USC § 1446(d): Notice to 18 Adverse Parties and State Court, and it reads: "Promptly 19 after the filing of such Notice of Removal of a civil 20 action, the Defendant or Defendants shall give written 21 notice thereof to all adverse parties and shall file a copy 22 of the notice with the clerk of such State Court, which 23 shall effect the removal and the State Court shall proceed 24 no further unless and until the case is remanded." 25 THE COURT: Let me ask you something. Have you 26 filed that with the clerk of the Court?

1	Proceedings
2	MS. QUINN: Yes, Your Honor.
3	THE COURT: With the clerk of the Court, not
4	Mr. Osman?
5	MS. QUINN: Yes, we've eFiled the Notice of
6	Removal.
7	THE COURT: To the clerk of the Court, not to
8	Mr. Osman?
9	MS. QUINN: Not to Mr. Osman, Your Honor.
10	THE COURT: Does it say to the clerk of the
11	Court?
12	MS. QUINN: We did we sent
13	THE COURT: I'm sorry. Let me just be clear. To
14	the clerk of the Court is referring to the County Clerk?
15	MS. QUINN: We eFiled it on NYSCEF, Your Honor.
16	THE COURT: Mr. Osman, is that filing with the
17	clerk of the Court.
18	THE CLERK: I'm checking on that now, Your Honor.
19	THE COURT: I just want to be clear that we
20	dotted all the I's and crossed all the T's, that giving it
21	to Mr. Osman is not filing it with the clerk of the Court.
22	MS. QUINN: Yes, Your Honor, we filed on NYSCEF
23	and e-mailed a copy to Mr. Osman.
24	THE COURT: Mr. Osman is not the clerk of the
25	Court.
26	MS. QUINN: Understood. That was just a courtesy
	Laura L. Ludovico, SCR

1 Proceedings 2 to him and to you, Your Honor. 3 THE COURT: So it's been filed now with the clerk 4 of the Court, you're saying, based on it being eFiled? 5 Yes, that's our position, Your Honor. MS. QUINN: 6 THE COURT: Mr. Osman, is that accurate? 7 THE CLERK: I'm checking on the protocol on 8 filing something with the clerk of the Court currently. 9 Just bear with me a moment. 10 THE COURT: Because if the language says "File 11 with the clerk of the Court," it means filed with the clerk 12 of the Court, not Mr. Osman, which is fine, I just want to 13 be clear that we're following the right guideline when you 14 say that that notice has been given to and filed with the 15 clerk of the Court. 16 Mr. Osman, you're looking it up, right? 17 THE CLERK: Yes, Your Honor. I'm reading it 18 currently. 19 THE COURT: Mr. Coles, while he's looking that 20 up, you understand that they're now saying that the interim 21 stay that the Court was going to issue would be 22 inappropriate since it's no longer -- the Court no longer 23 has jurisdiction? 2.4 MR. COLES: I have two answers to that, Your 25 Honor, without any of the documents, and they didn't even 26 give me the courtesy of sending the e-mail they sent to Laura L. Ludovico, SCR

1	Proceedings
2	Mr. Osman.
3	THE COURT: By the way, stop one second. You
4	said: "I'm sorry, I was remiss in failing to give notice
5	to
6	MS. QUINN: I meant the e-mail to Mr. Osman
7	advising him of the federal statute that we were just
8	discussing.
9	THE COURT: Well, let me ask you. How did you
10	already give notice to Mr. Coles of the removal?
11	MS. QUINN: Through the NYSCEF filing.
12	THE COURT: Okay.
13	MR. COLES: How do
14	THE COURT: Go ahead, Mr. Coles.
15	MR. COLES: Okay. First of all, I think the fact
16	that they didn't send me the same e-mail they sent to
17	Mr. Osman should make this filing void, but two other
18	points.
19	First, your order was entered into before they
20	did this filing.
21	THE COURT: I so ordered. The transcript was so
22	ordered. Ms. Quinn
23	MR. COLES: Yes, and that
24	THE COURT: My transcript granted the interim
25	stay pending the action before the Federal Court was so
26	ordered before I got Notice of Removal.
	Laura L. Ludovico, SCR

1 Proceedings 2 MS. QUINN: Yes, I understand that, Your Honor. 3 THE COURT: Well, let me be clear. This is 4 all -- I hate to be hypertechnical, but it really matters. 5 It matters because it is important. It may be that at the 6 end of the day it's of no moment because the 7 defendants/respondents had no intentions of, you know, 8 putting this out here before the issue gets before the 9 Federal Court, but just in an abundance of caution, belt 10 and suspenders, the order of this Court preceded your 11 Notice of Removal. 12 MS. QUINN: You mean by the --13 THE COURT: Whether or not it was uploaded and 14 filed with the clerk of the Court and whether notice was 15 given to the parties, the order of this court preceded 16 that. 17 MS. QUINN: You mean by the transcript? 18 THE COURT: Which was so ordered. 19 MS. QUINN: Okay. Yes, I can't really -- I can't 20 really disagree. I just wonder whether --21 THE COURT: I understand, but do you understand 22 where the Court is because -- I mean, quite honestly, 23 taking no position, the issue is a critical issue to the 2.4 petitioners/plaintiffs and in an abundance of caution on their behalf they are looking for nothing to happen, slip 25 26 through, while they're waiting to go to Federal Court and I

2.4

Proceedings

understand that. And if you were accurate with respect to what came first, I would have to comply with that, but in light of the fact that this Court's order, which granted the interim stay, preceded the Notice of Removal in compliance with rules and guidelines, the order of this Court stands.

MR. COLES: If I may be heard. She can appeal your order, she can move for reconsideration. She can't come in on an e-mail that's not sent to the other side and say vacate it. That's a completely improper, absurd process. The CPLR tells you how you challenge orders.

MS. QUINN: I'm sorry, Mr. Coles, if I may. I was not asking for a vacation of the order. I didn't realize that the order had already been issued. I did know that the transcript was so ordered, so I certainly was not seeking to vacate and order without letting you know. I was just informing the Court of --

MR. COLES: Okay, I got it. I think the order should stay for all of the reasons we talked about.

THE COURT: The order has to stand because it preceded either the Notice of Removal being provided to the Court or the Notice of Removal being provided to the petitioners/plaintiffs or the Notice of Petition being provided to the clerk of the Court. In light of all of that, the order of the Court stands.

1	Proceedings
2	MR. COLES: Thank you.
3	THE COURT: That's that.
4	MR. COLES: All right.
5	THE COURT: Mr. Osman?
6	THE CLERK: Yes, Your Honor.
7	THE COURT: I know this is hypertechnical, but
8	sometimes that's what we're dealing with.
9	THE CLERK: Right.
10	THE COURT: And I am going to that is all I
11	have to say. The order stands.
12	MR. COLES: Thank you, Your Honor. I'm going to
13	sign off.
14	THE COURT: And I will make sure a hard copy is
15	given to you all as an attachment to an e-mail in
16	accordance with the so ordered transcript so that if you
17	want to go, Ms. Quinn, immediately up to the Appellate
18	Division, you'll have the transcript, which you have to
19	order, and a hard copy, okay?
20	MR. COLES: Thank you, Your Honor.
21	THE CLERK: Your Honor, will you be so ordering
22	this transcript?
23	THE COURT: So ordered. Thank you.
24	Everyone, the best of luck to you all. Stay
25	safe.
26	MR. COLES: Thank you, Your Honor.

1	Proceedings
2	THE COURT: Most importantly, stay safe and stay
3	health. I'm logging off.
4	MS. QUINN: You too, Your Honor. Thank you.
5	* * * *
6	I, Laura L. Ludovico, a senior court reporter for
7	the State of New York, do hereby certify that the foregoing
8	is a true and accurate transcription of my original
9	stenographic notes. Saura J. Judanico
11	Laura L. Ludovico
12	Senior Court Reporter
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
	Laura L. Ludovico, SCR

	olroody [2] 15/10 17/15	oomo [1] 17/2
Case 1:20-cv-05441-KPF	already [2] 15/10 17/15 also [5] 4/8/5/3 5/24 10 19 0027/20/	came [1] 17/3 can [8] 4/4127/19 7/47 8/10 8/14 8/19
MR. COLES: [20] MS. LAZARO: [1] 8/22	am [2] 12/16 18/10	17/8 17/9
MS. QUINN: [33]	Americas [1] 2/4	can't [3] 16/19 16/19 17/9
MS. SAINT-FORT: [3] 4/26 5/6 5/10	ANN [1] 2/13	CAPACITY [5] 1/11 1/13 1/15 1/16 1/18
THE CLERK: [11] 4/3 4/6 4/9 10/18	answers [1] 14/24 ANTHONY [1] 2/5	1/18 CAPTAINS [1] 1/7
10/22 13/18 14/7 14/17 18/6 18/9	anticipatory [1] 7/24	CAROL [1] 1/25
18/21 THE COURT: [65]	any [4] 6/22 7/26 11/26 14/25	case [7] 6/5 8/9 9/23 10/13 10/16
	Anyone [1] 5/11	11/19 12/24
-	appeal [1] 17/8 appearances [3] 1/26 4/8 4/11	Cause [1] 8/10 caution [2] 16/9 16/24
X [2]	appearances [3] 1/20 4/8 4/11 appearing [1] 10/20	CAVARRETTA [1] 2/14
1/3 1/21 -against [1] 1/10	appears [1] 6/3	cc'ing [1] 12/16
	Appellate [1] 18/17	Centre [2] 1/21 2/26
1	application [3] 7/12 8/9 9/10 applications [1] 6/7	certain [2] 6/6 6/6
100 [1] 2/9	approximately [1] 6/15	certainly [1] 17/16 certify [1] 19/7
10007 [3] 1/22 2/9 3/2	are [9] 4/4 4/9 5/14 6/13 6/23 8/13	CHAIR [1] 1/18
10020-1104 [1] 2/5 1104 [1] 2/5	12/7 12/12 16/25	challenge [1] 17/12
1251 [1] 2/4	arises [1] 5/17	checking [2] 13/18 14/7
1446 [1] 12/17	Article [1] 6/2 as [17] 1/11 1/13 1/15 1/16 1/18 4/9	Church [1] 2/9 citing [3] 12/7 12/12 12/13
15 [1] 1/22	5/9 6/16 6/16 6/22 7/23 7/25 7/25 8/3	CITY [17] 1/5 1/6 1/11 1/12 1/12 1/13
154982/2020 [1] 1/10	8/3 9/8 18/15	1/14 1/15 1/17 1/17 2/7 4/22 5/2 5/18
2	ask [2] 12/25 15/9	5/25 6/17 8/12
2020 [2] 1/10 1/22	asking [2] 12/11 17/14	City's [1] 6/3
28 [1] 12/17	assessment [1] 6/22 ASSOCIATION [8] 1/3 1/4 1/5 1/5 1/6	civil [4] 1/2 5/18 8/12 12/19 CIVILIAN [2] 1/18 1/19
3	1/7 1/7 1/8	claims [1] 6/20
35 [1] 1/2	assurance [1] 8/10	clear [5] 11/11 13/13 13/19 14/13 16/3
	assurances [1] 8/15	clearly [1] 7/22
4	attach [1] 7/18 attached [1] 12/5	clerk [18] 2/15 12/22 12/26 13/3 13/7 13/10 13/14 13/14 13/17 13/21 13/24
420 [1] 2/26	attachment [1] 18/15	13/10 13/14 13/14 13/17 13/21 13/24
5	Attorneys [2] 2/4 2/8	17/25
50-a [5] 5/18 5/24 6/7 6/16 8/12	authority [1] 11/4	clients [1] 6/13
6	Avenue [1] 2/4	close [1] 6/9
60 [2] 1/21 2/26	aware [4] 8/20 8/23 11/7 12/8	COLES [12] 2/5 4/12 5/16 6/26 10/19 11/20 11/22 12/16 14/19 15/10 15/14
65,000 [1] 6/14	В	17/13
	bargaining [1] 5/26	colleague [1] 4/17
7	based [3] 7/8 12/3 14/4	collective [1] 5/25
78 [1] 6/2	basically [1] 6/21 be [23]	come [2] 6/9 17/10 COMMISSIONER [3] 1/13 1/15 1/16
Α	bear [1] 14/9	COMPLAINT [2] 1/18 1/19
about [1] 17/20	because [6] 8/9 14/10 16/5 16/6 16/22	completely [1] 17/11
Absolutely [1] 9/11	17/21	compliance [1] 17/6
absurd [1] 17/11	been [11] 6/7 6/15 7/8 7/10 8/20 8/23 8/24 11/2 14/3 14/14 17/15	comply [1] 17/3 concern [2] 8/8 8/25
abundance [2] 16/9 16/24 accordance [1] 18/16	before [15] 7/26 7/26 8/3 8/4 8/7 8/13	consented [1] 12/2
according [1] 12/6	8/26 9/3 9/18 11/5 15/19 15/25 15/26	consenting [1] 11/1
accurate [3] 14/6 17/2 19/8	16/8 16/8	considered [1] 7/19
action [2] 12/20 15/25	behalf [3] 4/23 5/3 16/25	contain [1] 6/19
ADDRÉSS [1] 1/21	being [9] 7/19 8/26 9/3 9/18 11/5 14/4 17/22 17/23 17/24	contract [1] 5/26 conversation [1] 8/5
addressed [1] 7/13 adjourned [1] 10/14	believe [5] 5/18 8/3 8/7 10/24 10/25	conversations [1] 6/8
adverse [2] 12/18 12/21	belt [1] 16/9	copy [4] 12/21 13/23 18/14 18/19
advising [1] 15/7	BENEVOLENT [4] 1/5 1/5 1/6 1/7	core [1] 5/22
after [1] 12/19	best [1] 18/24 BILL [1] 1/11	CORPORATION [1] 2/8
again [1] 9/23 against [1] 1/10	BLASIO [1] 1/11	correct [1] 11/6
ago [2] 12/2 12/4	BOARD [2] 1/19 1/19	correction [4]
agree [1] 9/14	BRANN [1] 1/14	could [3] 6/11 7/18 7/25
agreement [2] 6/9 6/12	Brief [2] 11/15 11/21	counsel [4] 2/8 4/13 5/12 9/15
ahead [2] 7/5 15/14	briefed [1] 6/11 brought [1] 9/18	COUNTY [2] 1/2 13/14 course [2] 8/8 8/25
all [17] 4/4 4/9 5/15 7/11 10/8 10/26 12/21 13/20 13/20 15/15 16/4 17/20		court [61]
17/25 18/4 18/10 18/15 18/24	<u>C</u>	Court's [3] 8/5 8/25 17/4
allegations [1] 6/21	call [1] 11/3	courtesy [2] 13/26 14/26

C Case 1:20-cy-05441-KPF	exactly [1] 9/26 Excellent [1] 11/151-1 Filed 07/20/2	hear [1] 5/12 heard [2] 6/26 19 823
CPLR [1] 17/12		
critical [4] 6/20 8/9 9/2 16/23	existence [1] 6/4	hearing [1] 9/10
crossed [1] 13/20	expect [1] 10/2	HER [1] 1/14 horo [5] 4/9 5/24 10/17 11/25 16/9
currently [2] 14/8 14/18	F	here [5] 4/9 5/24 10/17 11/25 16/8 hereby [1] 19/7
CYNTHIA [1] 1/14	F-O-R-T [1] 5/7	him [2] 14/2 15/7
D	fact [2] 15/15 17/4	HIS [4] 1/11 1/12 1/16 1/18
	failing [1] 15/4	hold [1] 6/11
DANIEL [1] 1/12 dash [1] 5/7	fashion [2] 8/19 9/16	HON [1] 1/25
DAVIE [1] 1/18	fashioning [1] 9/7	honestly [1] 16/22
day [1] 16/6	federal [15] 7/8 7/14 7/20 7/26 8/13	Honor [40]
DÉ [1] 1/11	8/24 8/26 9/3 9/9 9/19 11/5 15/7 15/25	hour [1] 12/2
dealing [1] 18/8	16/9 16/26 few [1] 12/4	how [4] 11/24 15/9 15/13 17/12
decision [1] 6/17	file [2] 12/21 14/10	However [1] 7/12 hypertechnical [2] 16/4 18/7
Defendant [1] 12/20	filed [6] 12/26 13/22 14/3 14/11 14/14	
defendants [6] 1/20 2/8 4/23 5/9 12/20	16/14	<u>l</u>
16/7 defendants/respondents [3] 4/23 5/9	filing [7] 12/19 13/16 13/21 14/8 15/11	l'll [2] 10/10 12/15
16/7	15/17 15/20	l'm [20]
DEPARTMENT [10] 1/12 1/13 1/14	finally [1] 9/25	l's [1] 13/20
1/15 1/17 1/17 2/7 4/23 5/2 6/8	fine [1] 14/12 fire [4] 1/2 1/12 1/13 6/14	l've [3] 6/7 9/26 10/23
DERMOT [1] 1/16	fire [4] 1/3 1/12 1/13 6/14 FIREFIGHTERS [1] 1/4	ignore [1] 6/4 immediately [5] 7/13 7/20 10/2 10/2
DETECTIVES' [1] 1/7	Firm [1] 4/13	18/17
determination [1] 6/22	first [5] 5/16 10/26 15/15 15/19 17/3	important [2] 9/21 16/5
did [5] 5/24 13/12 15/9 15/20 17/15	five [1] 6/13	importantly [1] 19/2
didn't [3] 14/25 15/16 17/14 directed [2] 5/17 10/5	following [2] 1/26 14/13	improper [1] 17/11
disagree [1] 16/20	foregoing [1] 19/7	inappropriate [3] 10/26 11/11 14/22
disclosure [2] 7/24 7/26	FORT [7] 2/10 5/2 5/6 5/7 10/5 10/19	INC [2] 1/5 1/6
disclosures [1] 8/11	10/25	inclined [1] 9/2
discussed [1] 11/2	forward [2] 7/15 9/24 FREDERICK [1] 1/18	independent [1] 6/4 Index [1] 1/9
discussing [1] 15/8	front [2] 12/9 12/13	indicated [1] 12/6
Division [1] 18/18	full [1] 10/3	indicates [1] 10/25
DLA [3] 2/3 4/14 4/18 do [10] 5/20 9/6 9/19 9/24 9/25 10/10	further [2] 11/19 12/24	individualized [1] 6/22
11/24 15/13 16/21 19/7	future [1] 9/24	information [2] 7/24 8/2
document [3] 6/21 7/11 12/5	G	informing [1] 17/18
documents [2] 6/10 14/25	gap [1] 9/4	intentions [1] 16/7
Does [1] 13/10	gap [1] 9/4 get [5] 4/7 4/8 4/11 5/15 12/15	interim [9] 7/19 7/25 9/1 9/3 9/17 11/2 14/20 15/24 17/5
DOMINIQUE [2] 2/10 5/1	gets [1] 16/8	internet [1] 6/18
don't [6] 5/15 9/4 9/22 11/26 12/9	getting [1] 8/13	interrupt [1] 6/26
12/13 done [3] 6/6 8/13 8/17	give [5] 8/10 12/20 14/26 15/4 15/10	is [47]
dotted [1] 13/20	given [3] 14/14 16/15 18/15	issue [10] 5/24 8/9 8/26 9/18 9/21 11/5
due [1] 5/26	giving [1] 13/20	14/21 16/8 16/23 16/23
dump [1] 6/21	go [4] 7/5 15/14 16/26 18/17	issued [1] 17/15
E	going [3] 14/21 18/10 18/12 good [3] 4/21 4/26 10/11	it [28] it's [8] 8/3 8/17 10/24 10/25 12/17 14/3
	got [3] 4/21 4/26 10/11 got [2] 15/26 17/19	14/22 16/6
e-mail [8] 10/23 12/4 12/17 14/26 15/6 15/16 17/10 18/15	GRACE [2] 2/13 8/20	
e-mailed [1] 13/23	grant [1] 9/2	<u>J</u>
earlier [1] 11/3	granted [2] 15/24 17/4	JO [1] 2/10
early [2] 6/16 7/25	GREATER [1] 1/4	JOHN [2] 2/6 4/17
echo [1] 5/15	guideline [1] 14/13 guidelines [1] 17/6	July [1] 1/22
EDMEAD [1] 1/25		jurisdiction [2] 7/9 14/23 just [17] 7/7 8/7 8/19 9/4 9/17 11/7
effect [1] 12/23	H	11/13 12/7 13/13 13/19 13/26 14/9
eFile [1] 7/17	had [5] 6/7 6/8 11/2 16/7 17/15	14/12 15/7 16/9 16/20 17/18
eFiled [3] 13/5 13/15 14/4	half [1] 12/2	Justice [1] 1/25
either [1] 17/22 else [1] 5/11	happen [1] 16/25	K
end [1] 16/6	hard [2] 18/14 18/19	-
endeavor [1] 8/14	has [9] 7/8 7/10 8/20 8/23 8/24 11/4	know [7] 7/7 9/22 10/3 16/7 17/15
ENDOWMENT [2] 1/7 1/8	14/14 14/23 17/21 hasty [1] 6/17	17/17 18/7
enforcement [1] 6/15	hate [1] 16/4	L
enter [1] 11/4	have [24]	language [1] 14/10
entered [1] 15/19	having [1] 6/9	last [2] 5/4 11/16
ESQ [4] 2/5 2/6 2/10 2/10 even [1] 14/25	he's [2] 12/8 14/19	LAURA [3] 2/25 19/6 19/11
everyone [3] 10/4 10/10 18/24	health [1] 19/3	law [13] 2/7 2/13 2/14 4/7 4/13 4/22
0.0190110 [0] 10/110/10/10/24		

NIGRO [1] 1/12 no[12] UN96/21-7/12 8/Filer/407//28/ problem [2] 9/6 11/26 proceed [2] 41/18 12/23 Case 1:20-cv-05441-KPF law... [7] 5/2 5/18 5/26 6/6 6/8 6/15 12/24 14/22 14/22 16/6 16/7 16/23 proceeding [1] 5/22 8/12 nonfinal [1] 6/20 process [2] 5/26 17/12 laws [1] 5/25 not [16] 5/14 5/24 6/12 9/22 10/26 promote [1] 6/18 LAZARO [1] 2/13 12/16 13/3 13/7 13/9 13/21 13/24 Promptly [1] 12/18 least [1] 10/24 14/12 16/13 17/10 17/14 17/16 protocol [1] 14/7 let [6] 7/7 9/25 12/25 13/13 15/9 16/3 notes [1] 19/9 provided [3] 17/22 17/23 17/25 let's [3] 4/7 4/8 5/12 nothing [1] 16/25 provision [4] 11/7 11/9 11/10 11/12 letting [1] 17/17 notice [15] 12/17 12/19 12/21 12/22 provisionally [1] 6/10 LIEUTENANTS [1] 1/6 publish [1] 6/18 13/5 14/14 15/4 15/10 15/26 16/11 light [2] 17/4 17/25 16/14 17/5 17/22 17/23 17/24 put [1] 6/10 LLP [1] 2/3 notify [1] 11/8 putting [1] 16/8 logging [1] 19/3 now [7] 5/16 7/8 10/10 11/20 13/18 long [2] 8/3 9/8 Q 14/3 14/20 longer [2] 14/22 14/22 question [5] 5/16 5/22 7/8 7/22 8/16 number [1] 6/8 look [1] 9/24 NYSCEF [3] 13/15 13/22 15/11 QUINN [10] 2/10 4/22 7/4 10/5 10/18 looking [3] 14/16 14/19 16/25 10/24 10/24 12/11 15/22 18/17 luck [2] 10/11 18/24 O quite [1] 16/22 LUDOVICO [3] 2/25 19/6 19/11 obtain [1] 8/14 R obviously [1] 5/22 off [2] 18/13 19/3 raising [1] 9/21 made [3] 8/20 8/23 11/7 OFFICE [1] 2/8 reach [1] 6/12 mail [8] 10/23 12/4 12/17 14/26 15/6 officers [2] 1/3 6/19 read [1] 12/7 15/16 17/10 18/15 officers' [2] 1/4 6/14 reading [2] 11/10 14/17 mailed [1] 13/23 reads [1] 12/18 OFFICIAL [6] 1/11 1/13 1/15 1/16 1/18 make [2] 15/17 18/14 1/21 realize [1] 17/15 makes [1] 11/10 really [3] 16/4 16/19 16/20 okay [17] 4/4 4/7 5/12 7/15 8/14 9/12 matter [7] 6/11 7/8 7/10 8/13 8/24 8/25 reason [1] 6/2 10/4 10/6 10/17 10/21 11/13 11/20 reasons [1] 17/20 15/12 15/15 16/19 17/19 18/19 matters [3] 6/23 16/4 16/5 one [3] 5/19 11/13 15/3 REBECCA [3] 2/10 4/22 7/4 may [4] 10/24 16/5 17/8 17/13 open [1] 8/17 recalled [1] 10/16 MAYOR [1] 1/11 received [1] 10/23 order [23] me [11] 9/25 11/11 12/10 12/14 12/25 ordered [7] 15/21 15/22 15/26 16/18 recessed [1] 10/13 13/13 14/9 14/26 15/9 15/16 16/3 reconsideration [1] 17/9 17/16 18/16 18/23 mean [3] 16/12 16/17 16/22 ordering [1] 18/21 record [2] 11/15 11/21 means [1] 14/11 orders [1] 17/12 records [1] 6/18 meant [1] 15/6 original [1] 19/8 referring [1] 13/14 members [1] 6/15 regarding [4] 5/25 5/26 5/26 6/2 OSMAN [21] mic [1] 5/14 related [1] 8/11 other [2] 15/17 17/10 MICHAEL [1] 2/14 release [1] 6/9 our [1] 14/5 moment [2] 14/9 16/6 out [2] 7/23 16/8 relief [1] 5/20 moments [1] 12/4 remand [1] 9/19 more [1] 7/12 Р remanded [3] 8/24 11/19 12/24 morning [3] 4/21 4/26 9/23 page [1] 1/26 remiss [2] 12/16 15/4 Most [1] 19/1 papers [1] 7/16 removal [11] 7/11 12/6 12/19 12/23 MOTION [1] 1/20 PART [1] 1/2 13/6 15/10 15/26 16/11 17/5 17/22 move [1] 17/9 parties [3] 12/18 12/21 16/15 17/23 Mr [4] 3/3 7/16 11/22 14/16 pause [2] 11/15 11/21 removed [2] 7/8 7/10 Mr. [27] pending [6] 8/25 9/3 9/9 9/18 11/4 repeal [5] 5/18 5/24 5/25 6/16 8/11 Mr. Coles [9] 5/16 6/26 10/19 11/20 15/25 reporter [4] 2/26 10/21 19/6 19/11 12/16 14/19 15/10 15/14 17/13 personnel [1] 6/18 respect [1] 17/2 Mr. Osman [17] 4/4 7/18 10/17 12/17 Petition [1] 17/24 Respectfully [1] 11/7 13/4 13/8 13/9 13/16 13/21 13/23 respondents [8] 1/20 2/8 4/23 5/3 5/9 petitioners [10] 1/9 2/4 4/13 5/13 6/5 13/24 14/6 14/12 15/1 15/6 15/17 18/5 7/23 8/8 9/16 16/24 17/24 7/4 9/13 16/7 Mr. Wray [1] 5/16 Respondents/Defendants [2] 1/20 2/8 petitioners/plaintiffs [5] 1/9 2/4 4/13 Ms. [10] 10/5 10/5 10/18 10/19 10/24 16/24 17/24 review [3] 1/19 1/19 6/6 10/24 10/25 12/11 15/22 18/17 phone [1] 10/20 right [8] 4/4 5/9 10/8 10/10 14/13 14/16 Ms. Quinn [7] 10/5 10/18 10/24 10/24 18/4 18/9 picture [1] 10/4 12/11 15/22 18/17 rights [3] 5/18 6/4 8/12 PIPER [3] 2/3 4/14 4/18 Ms. Saint [1] 10/5 plaintiffs [9] 1/9 2/4 4/13 5/13 6/5 7/23 Room [1] 2/26 Ms. Saint-Fort [2] 10/19 10/25 9/16 16/24 17/24 rule [1] 6/7 much [4] 5/21 7/6 9/20 9/21 plaintiffs/petitioners [3] 5/13 7/23 9/16 rules [1] 17/6 mute [1] 5/14 please [5] 5/5 5/14 7/2 11/12 12/7 rushed [1] 6/17 my [5] 4/12 4/17 6/13 15/24 19/8 point [1] 7/23 points [1] 15/18 police [4] 1/5 1/17 1/17 6/13 S-A-I-N-T [1] 5/6 name [2] 4/12 5/4 safe [2] 18/25 19/2 position [4] 6/3 11/3 14/5 16/23 need [2] 5/20 6/2 preceded [4] 16/10 16/15 17/5 17/22 said [5] 8/7 9/17 9/26 12/5 15/4 NEW [29] prior [1] 8/12 SAINT [7] 2/10 5/2 5/6 5/7 10/5 10/19

Next [3] 4/16 4/20 4/25

tells [1] 17/12 tella [1] 16/14 16/18 17/14 17/16 17/16 17/18 tella [1] 17/16 17/16 17/18 tella [1] 17/16 17/18 17/16 17/18 17/16 17/18 17/16 17/18 S Case 1:20-cv-05441-KPF SAINT... [1] 10/25 TERM [1] 1/2 we [21] SAINT-FORT [3] 2/10 5/2 5/7 thank [20] we'll [1] 9/22 same [1] 15/16 that [71] we're [2] 14/13 18/8 SAMMER [1] 2/15 that's [8] 9/12 9/13 11/6 14/5 17/10 we've [1] 13/5 say [7] 7/12 9/25 12/12 13/10 14/14 17/11 18/3 18/8 week [1] 6/16 17/11 18/11 their [2] 8/9 16/25 well [8] 4/9 5/9 5/25 7/10 8/16 10/11 saying [3] 8/18 14/4 14/20 then [5] 4/8 4/11 7/11 7/13 7/17 15/9 16/3 says [6] 8/19 9/17 9/26 11/9 11/17 there [8] 4/5 7/12 7/19 7/24 7/26 8/8 well-settled [1] 5/25 14/10 8/11 9/4 were [3] 11/3 15/7 17/2 says that [1] 11/9 thereof [1] 12/21 what [8] 8/6 8/17 9/17 9/26 12/7 12/12 scoping [1] 6/6 they [13] 4/9 6/3 12/2 12/3 12/5 12/5 17/3 18/8 second [2] 11/13 15/3 when [3] 11/3 12/12 14/13 12/6 14/25 14/26 15/16 15/16 15/19 Secretary [2] 2/13 2/14 where [2] 12/5 16/22 16/25 sectaries [1] 4/7 they're [2] 14/20 16/26 WHEREUPON [2] 10/13 10/16 section [1] 12/6 think [2] 15/15 17/19 whether [4] 9/22 16/13 16/14 16/20 see [5] 7/11 8/6 8/17 9/22 10/2 this [31] which [10] 6/9 7/25 11/2 11/10 12/7 seeking [1] 17/17 those [2] 7/16 8/15 12/22 14/12 16/18 17/4 18/18 send [1] 15/16 thought [1] 12/1 while [3] 6/11 14/19 16/26 sending [1] 14/26 thousands [1] 6/19 who [4] 6/7 6/13 10/17 10/19 senior [3] 2/26 19/6 19/11 through [2] 15/11 16/26 Who's [1] 7/1 sent [5] 12/4 13/12 14/26 15/16 17/10 Why [1] 5/20 will [10] 7/13 7/19 7/25 8/7 8/11 9/16 time [1] 9/24 sentence [3] 11/10 11/12 11/16 today [7] 5/20 5/23 6/2 7/25 8/4 8/4 8/7 SERGEANTS [1] 1/6 told [2] 6/7 6/15 9/25 9/26 18/14 18/21 settled [2] 5/25 6/5 withdrawn [1] 12/3 Tony [1] 4/12 shall [6] 11/18 12/13 12/20 12/21 too [1] 19/4 without [2] 14/25 17/17 12/23 12/23 transcript [7] 15/21 15/24 16/17 17/16 wonder [1] 16/20 she [4] 12/7 17/8 17/9 17/9 18/16 18/18 18/22 working [1] 10/3 SHEA [1] 1/16 transcription [1] 19/8 would [6] 6/10 8/4 9/9 11/11 14/21 short [2] 9/16 9/26 transfer [1] 10/3 17/3 should [2] 15/17 17/20 TRO [2] 6/2 9/10 true [1] 19/8 WRAY [3] 2/6 4/17 5/16 Show [1] 8/10 written [1] 12/20 side [1] 17/10 two [3] 6/14 14/24 15/17 sign [1] 18/13 signed [1] 10/1 yes [22] simply [2] 6/3 7/23 ultimately [1] 6/11 YORK [29] since [2] 12/3 14/22 under [2] 6/5 6/9 you [64] SKYPE [4] 1/20 1/24 2/2 2/12 understand [11] 5/17 8/6 9/5 9/12 9/19 you'll [2] 5/4 18/18 slip [1] 16/25 12/11 14/20 16/2 16/21 16/21 17/1 you're [6] 5/8 10/26 11/10 12/13 14/4 so [18] 5/14 7/6 8/10 9/15 10/3 10/23 understanding [1] 9/8 14/16 12/8 14/3 15/21 15/21 15/25 16/18 your [46] Understood [1] 13/26 17/16 17/16 18/16 18/16 18/21 18/23 unfounded [1] 6/23 something [2] 12/25 14/8 UNIFORMED [2] 1/3 1/4 sometimes [1] 18/8 unions [3] 6/13 6/14 6/14 ZIP [1] 2/9 sorry [8] 6/25 6/25 7/3 12/10 12/15 unless [3] 8/16 11/19 12/24 13/13 15/4 17/13 unproven [1] 6/23 speaking [2] 5/14 7/2 unsubstantiated [1] 6/20 spell [1] 5/4 until [3] 8/17 11/19 12/24 stand [1] 17/21 up [4] 12/16 14/16 14/20 18/17 stands [3] 17/7 17/26 18/11 upload [1] 7/17 STATE [6] 1/2 11/18 12/18 12/22 uploaded [1] 16/13 12/23 19/7 us [2] 2/3 7/12 statute [1] 15/7 USC [1] 12/17 stay [19] 7/13 7/19 7/25 9/2 9/3 9/9 9/17 9/18 10/11 11/2 11/4 11/11 14/21 15/25 17/5 17/20 18/24 19/2 19/2 vacate [2] 17/11 17/17 stenographic [1] 19/9 vacation [1] 17/14 stop [1] 15/3 verge [1] 6/17 Street [3] 1/21 2/9 2/26 very [3] 5/21 9/20 9/21 subparagraph [1] 5/19 VIA [4] 1/20 1/24 2/2 2/12 such [2] 12/19 12/22 void [1] 15/17 SUPREME [2] 1/2 1/25 sure [2] 5/6 18/14 W suspenders [1] 16/10 waiting [1] 16/26 wake [1] 6/16 want [5] 6/3 9/4 13/19 14/12 18/17 T's [1] 13/20 wanted [1] 11/8 taking [1] 16/23 was [17] 6/11 10/16 11/7 12/4 13/26 talked [1] 17/20 14/21 15/4 15/19 15/21 15/25 16/13 Tell [1] 11/11